



## DESIGN REVIEW BOARD RECORD OF DECISION

Meeting Date December 15, 2016

DRB Case No. PDR 1527952-B

Address 1723 Sombra Drive

Applicant Craig Phillips

**PROPOSAL:** To construct a new two-story, 2,785 square-foot single family residence with an attached two-car garage on a 9,330 square-foot lot located in the R1 (FAR District II) Zone.

### DESIGN REVIEW

Board Member	Motion	Second	Yes	No	Absent	Abstain
Benlian		X	X			
Charchian	X		X			
Malekian					X	
Simonian				X		
Totals			<b>2</b>	<b>1</b>		
<b>DRB Decision</b>		Approve with conditions and a consideration				

### Condition:

1. Reduce the mass and scale of the new house to provide better neighborhood compatibility and limit the impacts on the site's oak trees. If a second floor remains in the proposal, it should be significantly reduced in size and feature greater setbacks from the first-floor exterior walls. Reducing the sense of mass at the street façade shall be a key goal of the revised design.
2. Revise the building footprint to help accomplish goals of Condition 1. Options could include redesigning the first floor to make its footprint less square, and/or utilizing the northwest portion of the lot where there is less tree coverage.
3. Provide updated arborist's report to reflect all changes proposed in order to meet the conditions of approval.
4. The applicant must comply with all mitigation measures identified in the Urban Forestry Department Comments dated October 19, 2016, except as amended by the updated arborist report as required by condition number 3. The applicant must comply with all recommendations in the report as made by the Arborist of Record and required by the City's Urban Forestry Department.
5. Use only one roof pitch, preferably 3:12, at all roof areas.
6. Incorporate on-grade permeable pavers at the driveway to better protect the tree roots in this area.

### Consideration:

1. That the roof form along the easterly façade wrap the building to avoid an awkward termination point.

## Analysis

**Site Planning:** The proposed site planning is appropriate, as modified by any conditions, to the site and its surroundings for the following reasons:

- Existing on-site conditions, such as the 13 oak trees, the recorded driveway easement along the westerly portion of the lot, and the curved front property line, influence the project's site planning.
- The building is sited towards the easterly half of the lot in such a way as to address setback regulations and the driveway easement, while minimizing the removal of protected trees. As it relates to the neighbors that directly abut the subject property, the new home is setback 20'-3" from the northerly property line, and approximately 37'-5" from the westerly property line. The code required minimum 6'-0" interior setback along the easterly portion of the property is adjacent to the park.
- Extending the building footprint into the northwest portion of the site could help reduce the overall sense of mass.
- The new house is setback 25'-0" from the street-front along Sombra Drive, which is the minimum required street-front setback in this zone. The proposed building location provides sufficient separation between the street and the house.
- The existing homes along Sombra Drive consist of single-family homes with detached garages located towards the rear of the property. While the proposed attached garage is not consistent with the predominant neighborhood pattern, it is appropriate for this project site as there are site planning constraints due to the oak trees. The volume of the new garage projects beyond the front elevation plane of the new house, but based on the curvature of the lot at the front, as seen from the street the two volumes will be in line with the minimum 25'-0" street-front setback required for this zone.
- The new driveway is proposed of permeable stone pavers, and a portion of the driveway has been minimized to 9'-0" to avoid impacting the adjacent oak trees. The site plan and landscape plans indicate that there is a separation between the driveway and the walkway that is not shown in the renderings. A condition of approval is added, based on DRB comments, to incorporate on-grade permeable pavers at the driveway to better protect the tree roots in this area.
- The applicant is proposing to remove three of the existing 13 oak trees on-site and preserve the remaining ten. The Indigenous Tree Report has been reviewed by the City's Urban Forestry Department, and departmental comments are attached to this report. Based on DRB comments, a condition of approval is added that requires the applicant to provide an updated Arborist's report for the revised design and strictly adhere to all recommendations in the report as made by the Arborist of Record and required by the City's Urban Forestry Department.
- The project features drought tolerant landscaping that is compatible with the proposed neo-craftsman style of the house and the 10 remaining oak trees that are proposed to be maintained.

**Mass and Scale:** The proposed mass and scale are appropriate, as modified by any conditions, to the site and its surroundings for the following reasons:

- With the exception of the adjacent property at the rear, the predominant neighborhood pattern features one-story homes ranging from 1,008 to 1,950 square feet in size with detached garages. The adjacent property at the rear is two-stories tall and 2,282 square-feet in size. Based on the site constraints of the existing oak trees on the property, the applicant's proposal to build a two-story house with an attached two-car garage, versus a one-story house with a detached garage, is appropriate.
- The overall height of the two-story house will be 24'-4", where the maximum height allowed is 28'-0" for a house with a pitched roof.
- The proposed 2,785 square-foot home will be the largest home in the neighborhood (300 foot radius). The applicant utilizes architectural devices such as changes in façade planes and stepping the second floor in from the first floor to visually break up the massing.
- The second floor is setback from the first floor on the north, south, and westerly façades to visually reduce the massing. Along the northerly façade, the second-floor building setback ranges from 3'-11" to 5'-6"; along the southerly façade facing the street, the second-floor building setback ranges from 11'-5" to 16'-0"; and along the westerly façade, the second-floor building setback is 6'-6". The easterly façade is adjacent to the park and features a two-story volume. The limited visibility of this façade from the street helps to prevent the massing from being overbearing on this elevation. Based on DRB comments, a condition is added to further increase some of these setbacks by significantly reducing the size of the second floor.

- The proposed gable roof forms are compatible with the neo-Craftsman style of the house, but the use of two different pitches (3:12 on the first floor, and 4.5:12 on the second floor) is at odds with the chosen style's typical use of a single pitch throughout. A condition is recommended to use only one pitch, preferably 3:12.

**Building Design and Detailing:** The proposed building design and detailing are appropriate, as modified by any conditions, to the site and its surroundings for the following reasons:

- The residence is designed in a neo-Craftsman style and incorporates appropriate siding and detailing to reflect the style.
- The front door is located within a recessed entryway that provides visual interest to the front elevation and a sense of arrival to the structure, as encouraged by the Design Guidelines. The new wooden entry door is appropriate to the craftsman-inspired design of the house with partial glazing and sidelites on each side
- The new windows will be white fiberglass with external grids and will be recessed in the wall openings with wood frames and sills, consistent with the craftsman-inspired design of the house. The new windows will be combination of primarily single-hung, with some fixed windows. The configuration, material, and finish of the windows are complementary and appropriate to the proposed architectural style.
- The proposed materials for the new house features hardiplank cladding, asphalt shingle roofing, and stone veneer at the base of the columns of the front entry which is appropriate to the craftsman-inspired style of the building. In addition, the color palette and lighting, as shown in the elevations, complement the selected style.
- The north and south facing gables feature vertical wood siding and eave brackets consistent with the proposed neo-craftsman style. Furthermore, the first floor roof form at the east elevation has an awkward termination point. The applicant may consider wrapping this roof form along this elevation to provide better design consistency.
- Permeable paving materials are proposed for the driveway and walkways, which is consistent with the style and the City's Design Guidelines.
- The proposed mechanical equipment and trash location area are along the easterly elevation and are appropriately located and screened from view.

**The Design Review Board approves/recommends the design of projects only. Approval/recommendation of a project by the Design Review Board does not constitute an approval of compliance with the Zoning Code and/or Building Code requirements.**

If an appeal is not filed within the 15-day appeal period of the Design Review Board decision, plans may be submitted for Building and Safety Division plan check. **Prior** to Building and Safety Division plan check submittal, Design Review Board approved plans must be stamped approved by Design Review Board staff. **Any** changes to the approved plans may constitute returning to the Design Review Board for approval. **Prior** to Building and Safety Division plan check submittal, **all** changes in substantial conformance with approved plans by the Design Review Board must be on file with the Planning Division.

Please make an appointment with the case planner for DRB stamp/sign-off prior to submitting for Building plan check.

**DRB Staff Member** Vista Ezzati, Planning Assistant