



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION RECORD OF DECISION

Meeting Date June 21, 2018 HPC Case No. PHPCPDR1808910

Address 1330 North Louise Street

Applicant Daniel Cordova

Project Summary: The applicant is proposing to construct a wood pergola, outdoor fireplace, wood deck, and pool and spa in the rear yard; add French doors at the main house laundry room; and convert the existing 444 square-foot detached garage into an Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU), including the addition of 156 square-feet at the rear of the ADU.

Historic Preservation Commission:

Board Member	Motion	Second	Yes	No	Absent	Abstain
Cragnotti		X	X			
Doom			X			
Morgan			X			
Shier			X			
Vartanian	X		X			
Totals			5	0		
DRB Decision		Approve with conditions				

Conditions:

1. Revise the elevations of the garage to include the flared roof peaks and vertical gable vents and indicate that these existing features will remain.
2. Provide sample/cutsheet of splash line pool tile for staff review and approval.
3. Staff to visit site prior to permit issuance to investigate historic and replacement doors at the rear façade to determine most appropriate approach for the design of the new French doors at the kitchen.

ANALYSIS:

Site Planning:

The proposed site planning is appropriate, as modified by any proposed conditions, to the site and its surroundings for the following reasons:

- The new pool, spa, deck, pergola, and fireplace between the house and garage will maintain the open appearance of the existing yard.
- The site plan will remain similar to the existing due to the modest size of the bedroom addition at the garage, which faces the rear of the property and will not be visible from the street.
- The garage will continue to appear as a garage from the street as the existing garage doors will remain.
- No changes are proposed to the existing driveway and fence.
- The landscape palette is appropriate to the style of the property.

Massing and Scale:

The proposed massing and scale are appropriate, as modified by any proposed conditions, to the site and its surroundings for the following reasons:

- The mass and scale of the proposed pergola and outdoor fireplace and small one-story addition at the rear of the proposed ADU will be compatible with the existing structures and surrounding houses.
- The addition is well articulated and follows the stylistic logic of the existing garage.
- The bedroom addition will be subordinate to the existing garage/proposed ADU, with its east and west walls setback from the adjoining existing walls and its roof being lower than the adjacent roof and of the same pitch.
- The bedroom addition will not be visible from the street and will not impact the overall mass or scale of the proposed ADU.

Design and Detailing:

The proposed design and detailing are appropriate, as modified by any proposed conditions, to the site and its surroundings for the following reasons:

- The cedar pergola and river stone outdoor fireplace (with rustic wood mantle) complement the Craftsman style architecture while being of clearly contemporary construction.
- The garage conversion and addition, as well as the new French doors on the house, will be architecturally compatible with the existing Craftsman style of the house.
- A new window will be installed on the east wall of the proposed ADU that will be appropriate to the style and period of the garage. The window will be true divided light, recessed with a wood sill and frame. The shape and size of the window will clearly indicate that it is not an original feature without diminishing the historic character of the structure.
- The window on the north side of the existing garage will be reused on the north side of the proposed ADU bedroom keeping the existing style and retaining historic fabric.
- The ADU addition will be clad with horizontal wood lap siding, differentiating it from the shingle siding at the house and garage while remaining true to the Craftsman style. The slate color asphalt shingle roof will match the existing roof.
- The sliding garage doors will be reused and converted into a wall system within the existing opening. This will maintain the historic fabric and the garage's appearance as seen from the street, therefore conforming to ADU requirements in historic districts.
- The design of the pool and decks features an appropriately contemporary design rooted in the Craftsman aesthetic.
- The new concrete paving and scoring pattern will closely match the historic concrete paving on the property.
- The new wood deck area next to the pool would not be a feature of the Craftsman era, which is true of the pool itself, but clearly reflects the time of its construction and will not diminish the historic character of the property.
- There will be no change to the existing driveway.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

- The property will remain a single-family residence and retain the appearance of a detached garage.
- The historic appearance and character of the property will be retained and no character defining features will be affected, while allowing for more contemporary uses in the backyard.
- The changes to the property at both the garage and the new pool area will be clearly recognizable as contemporary interventions that are compatible with the historic character of the property.
- The quirky brick paving at the rear yard is clearly not from the Craftsman era and was installed at an unknown date. Though of visual interest, there is no indication that it has acquired any historic significance over the years and its replacement will not affect the historic character of the property.
- All distinctive features and finishes will be retained, most notably in the conversion of the historic garage doors into a wall to allow for the ADU conversion.
- No character defining materials or features will be destroyed. The new work for the ADU and ADU addition will be differentiated by its differential massing and use of a different cladding materials, providing visual clues that the conversion/addition is a later intervention.

- If the bedroom addition were removed in the future, the original design of the garage could easily be restored. The same is true for the garage doors, which could be made operable again and the new window at the west garage façade, which could be infilled and reclad with appropriate shingles.

Notes:

If an appeal is not filed within the 15-day appeal period of the Historic Preservation Commission decision, plans may be approved for Building Division plan check. Prior to Building Division plan check submittal, HPC approved plans must be stamped approved by the Design Review staff.

Contact the case planner for an appointment for a Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) approval stamp. HPC stamps will no longer be stamped over the counter without an appointment.

The Historic Preservation Commission approves the design of project only. Approval of a project by the Historic Preservation Commission does not constitute an approval of compliance with the Zoning Code and/or Building Code requirements.

Any changes to the approved plans may constitute returning to the HPC for approval. Prior to Building Division plan check submittal, all changes in substantial conformance with approved plans by the HPC must be on file with the Planning Division.

Staff Member

Kathy Duarte